Harriet Beecher Stowe in José Martí's "The Black Doll"

Miguel Cabrera Peña Professor and journalist Cuban. Resident of Santiago de Chile

José Martí (1853-1895) never fleshed out and finished his critique of Harriet Beecher Stowe's *Uncle Tom's Cabin*. He did, however, leave us some evidence of what his opinion, as an artistic and literary critic, was of the work. Thus, we must consider his praise of this book, whose popularity in the nineteenth century is impressive, even today.

Martí felt that the novel helped "hasten the abolition of slavery in the United States," and succeeded in highlighting "the suffering and miserable life of slaves." He considered Stowe"prolific" and added that she curbed her indignation and ire"in describing the tortures her characters endured."1These thoughts come from a brief piece in which he proposes the "opportunity" (1852) the book offered when it was published. Critic Rafael Cepeda is correct in observing biblical and parabolic meaning in Uncle Tom's Cabin. Its characters are inscribed with both purity and impurity, with idealization; they are not construed as being good or evil:2"Tom's death represents a vicarious sacrifice: for the good of many,"says Martí, which is correct.

Yet, Tom, who witnesses atrocious punishments, is bought and sold, whipped and humiliated, never raising a rebellious defense, even

after he is separated from his family. Beyond any biblical allusion, the remaining image is that of someone passive who does not ever fight for his freedom. The reader, on the other hand, knows of his bravery when he saved the girl Eva, daughter of Mr. Augustine Saint Clare, the landowner who will have some consideration for him, humanely speaking. He or she also knows that his refusal to give up Christianity cost him his life. Yet, some of the accusations against the novel, that it is paternalistic, are true, as is the fact that it promoted harmful stereotypes about blacks. It's not surprising, then, that there is nothing in Marti's comments about the Tom character. Tom was the opposite of the black Cuban independence fighters who had participated, like most, in both independence wars against Spain, and who would once again fight in the one Martí himself would organize.

If Martí wants blacks to be rebellious against Madrid, he also calls for them—more than once—to rebel on account of their rights. One can see this in his work and consider it a contribution to his legacy on the race issue.

In speaking of Stowe's book, Martí says it is like a "tear that speaks!" and compares it

with Helen Hunt Jackson's novel *Ramona*, which he is the first to translate into Spanish. He favors this text about Indians even more than Stowe's, establishing this in the translation's prologue, while also explaining the place he gives both books. What makes Helen Hunt Jackson's novel artistically superior to *Uncle Tom's Cabin* is its succession of events, which go from "the passive misfortune of the submissive, hardworking, and discreet Indians [to] the invasion's brutal catastrophe...the flame of defiance"

It is in this manner that Jackson "reveals more talent than Harriet Beecher Stowe" Jackson showing the rebelliousness of the Indians after their lands were invaded is partly what makes her novel superior. Martí goes on to specify that Ramona is another Uncle Tom Cabin, free of "Beecher Stowe's book's weaknesses."4 Cepeda does not mention this extremely important opinion by Martí, from September 1887, but does analyze the stratification of Stowe's characters, which enriches the book's use of symbolism, among other things, and gives it the popular, propagandistic tone one might use for waging the ongoing and vicious ideological battle against slavery at that time.

Some critics praised Stowe for her capacity to move readers but criticized her for actually knowing nothing of slave life. It is important here to note that Martí analyzed *Uncle Tom's Cabin* in 1887, one year after he broke his near silence on the African-American situation in the United States.

Margaret Just Butcher underlines the fact that after the publication of Stowe's book, the southern United States responded to it with insults, and more than a dozen novels of its own about slavery. According to Butcher, the popular interest and sentimental melodrama of Stowe's earlier book—*Uncle Tom's Cabin*—actually surpassed that of her second one's,

and limited the triumph of Stowe's second novel, 5 Dred: A Tale of the Dismal Swamp, despite the fact it addressed some of the earlier book's artistic shortcomings, and resulted in a more cautious, convincing, and harmonious work. Even so, Dred became yet another best-seller. Stowe had already responded to southern attacks with the publication of her study, A Key to Uncle Tom, in which she offered historical facts, in an attempt to support the fiercely criticized yet also acclaimed way in which she represented the treatment of blacks. Martí, for his part, added nothing to this debate about the novel's weaknesses, "although his use of the plural implies they are more than one.

One hundred and fifty years have passed since the publication of *Uncle Tom's Cabin*, yet there is still no really balanced criticism of the novel. In their radicalism, important, mid twentieth-century. African-American intellectuals and writers surpassed their very necessary consideration of the book, no longer just regarding its ideology but also for its literary merits. Lawrie Balour recalls that James Baldwin, whose opinion of the racial ideas in the narrative was very negative, "demolish[ed] its literary value" in his "Everybody's Protest Novel,"6 first published at the end of the 1940s. Yet, a 2007 reexamination of Uncle Tom's Cabin by scholar Henry Louis Gates, Jr. challenges the talented Baldwin's criticism, as well as a wealth of other opinions that ended up trashing the book. For this Harvard academic, Uncle Tom's Cabin is a foundational document regarding race relations in the United States, and a significant moral and political exploration of the nature of these relations.7 Gates, not surprisingly, who examines the novel's weaknesses as well, is also criticized by the U.S. academe.

Back in his time, Martí appreciated the book's importance for U.S. literature and history but does attribute to it "weaknesses," as was mentioned earlier. This focus on accuracies and faults seems to mark the history of the novel's criticism, at least for the remainder of this century.

"The Black Doll"

Aurora de Albornoz wrote of José Martí's story"The Black Doll"that it "may be no coincidence"that it is black." Of course, Albornoz is not referring to the racial theme itself, but rather to the world of emotions and the field of infant psychology, as well as to the impressionism of Martí's prose. If we examine the topic of race in "The Black Doll," as regards its function within its structure, and even in the story's development, we find it is not quite significant, but rather is at its very core.

It is possible that the first kernel of the story "The Black Doll" comes to Martí not via Beecher Stowe's novel but from his inquiry into the life of her brother: abolitionist Henry Ward Beecher. In deconstructing Ward Beecher's infancy, he discovers that "Harriet, who would much later write *Uncle Tom's Cabin*," wanted someone to make her a doll."

I might even dare to assume that another hint of this story came to him from an idea that was not properly his: the girl, Piedad, wants the black doll "because no one loves [her]."This is the essence of a story that is not meant to have a moral. Moreover, it is so essential that the doll be black—and of the black race—that the story could bear no other title but that of "The Black Doll."

If for poet and essayist Aurora de Albornoz the story is a "masterpiece," then it fits beautifully in the collection *La Edad de Oro* (1889), "a book about social behavior that Martí crafted for children," as Mirta Aguirre classifies it. Among the many subjects it touches upon "the most important is the notion of

the equality of man," she explains, and expert Eduardo Lolo, seconds this notion.

How does "The Black Doll" connect with *Uncle Tom's Cabin*? Is it the case that Martí owes its plot, or perhaps the opportunity or spark from which to recreate so valuable an idea? No. The poet does not owe it the story's plot but does have a debt with the opportunity it gave him to recreate the idea, an ambiance, and offer an anti-racist perspective. But the aforementioned connection also makes it a less than obvious tribute on his part to Harriet Beecher Stowe, the great champion of abolition, despite her limitations.

"The Black Doll" is a descriptive story that embraces a Modernist style and form that will become essential to Latin American literature's later development of the magical realism and 'marvelous reality.' Through Martí, the reader gains access to the little girl's room, her noble feelings, her father's mode of thinking and occupation, and her presents. Except for in the introductory paragraph, we find Piedad remembering, looking for a branch of forget-me-nots, sleeping, thinking, and "talking to"her black doll, which she has named Leonor, and is among the cheapest of her expensive toys.

We do not find in the story the flashiness that Mexican critic Alfonso Reyes attributes to the story's writer. Its lyricism is delicate: it flows from timeless souls. Piedad, and her feelings, in particular, rise up, just like the story's real-life protagonists. The girl turns eight during the story. There is a party and happiness, and she is given an expensive doll. Despite the toy's sophistication, it does not "talk" to the girl. In addition, its aristocratic style makes the girl believe that this "lady doll" could demand "coaches and footmen." Its 'part' in the story ends when Piedad sits her on the ground with her face against a tree

trunk. Yet, we should go back to the story in *Uncle Tom's Cabin*.

Eva Saint Clare is the daughter of slave owner Augustine St. Clare, an established landowner in New Orleans with many slaves. Ironically, he often puts art before business. and piano music before silence. Augustine represents a loving and kind father who tells his daughter that she is the only thing he has in the world. Many are the scenes with them together. When the girl dies, Mr. Saint Clare descends into a deep crisis. In Martí's story, Piedad's father "has thought about the girl a great deal."The nameless father "thinks of her every time the fragrance of the garden's flowers wafts through the window." In his loving fantasies, he sees her in the clouds. Back in the story's reality, the girl happily sits on his lap and finds refuge on his chest, even though "his beard really tickled her!"

More than one critic agrees that Piedad's mother behaves like a shadow in Marti's story, but he does not even minimally allow her to leave her imprint in it, or give her at least a silouette. Experts think the mother seems to vanish as though she'd barely even existed, but in reality this is not true. The woman sends particularly revealing messages, if we consider *Uncle Tom's Cabin*. It is intriguing that in one of Piedad's briefest mentions of her, she calls her mother a "bad mother!" This was her reaction to the woman not letting her take her black doll out for a walk.

It is also her mother who calls Piedad "impulsive," when she expresses her desire to go see the doll, which Piedad's mother has punished by locking her in the girl's room. It might be worth it to conjecture that if Martí believed that blacks were an unknown to whites,¹² the doll's lockup brings about what would later be termed the invisibility of blacks. Elsewhere in the story, when the

mother tries to embrace the girl, the latter rejects her, claiming: "you killed my flower."

María Saint Clare, Eva's mother in Beecher Stowe's novel, is a relentlessly antiblack character. The author makes her haughty, selfish, weak, apathetic, and sick of mind. She sells Tom to his assassin. The mothers in both fictional works share some qualities, as do the fathers, but in an opposite manner. Regarding the crux of both stories. Eva's feelings are very similar to those of Marti's Piedad. Eva, who is close in age to the main character in "The Black Doll," and equally loquacious, cries when she hears about the mistreatment of slaves, and makes her father promise to free them—once she dies—since she knows she is in delicate health. Eva was a friend to Tom, Mummy, and other slaves, and there is no doubt that Piedad loved her black doll.

There are other ways in which Eva and Piedad are alike. The latter shares all her love. just like the former, whose name is not Eva but rather Evangeline, from the Greek word for 'Gospel,' 'good news,' which is also what 'Piedad' means. The girl in the story does not wear the halo that Eva, who is closest to heaven, wears, but her fantasies have equally Christian underpinnings. The black doll, for her part, is called Leonor, like Marti's mother and first sister. The girl in Marti's story takes the black cook a red dahlia, and fastens it to his apron. She makes the washwoman a laurel wreath and fills the maid's pocket with orange blossoms. Eva, for her part, decorates Tom with jasmines in each buttonhole, and graces him with a necklace made of roses.

Excepting the Christian correspondence between the Cuban poet and Beecher Stowe, anyone might think that my way of seeing things is in line with other critiques of Martí's work. Nevertheless, I do not believe that the evidence of any connection between the novel and Martí's very short story can be attributed to mere coincidence.

Topsy and "The Black Doll"

"The Little Evangelist" chapter in *Uncle Tom's Cabin* is the most important part of Beecher Stowe's story. Martí sees in this chapter the crux of his work. But before getting beyond this section's header, let us delve into the previous one. "Topsy," as it is titled, is an "eight or nine year old" black girl who was removed by Eva's father, through purchase, from a place where she was constantly hit, and where she worked as a maid, dishwasher, water girl, etc.

Beecher Stowe writes that Topsy's poor little body bore the calluses and traces of whippings. This girl, who was raised surrounded by savagery, is fatherless and motherless, has no family, habitually lies, and is surprised when she tries to steal, even though her treatment is much better at the Saint Clare home. This attitude, which various critics see as having promoted the negative, *pickanniny* stereotype of African-American girls, initiates a dialogue between the two works. Topsy will reveal the root of her behavior.

Since her arrival at the Saint Clare home, Topsy was placed under the tutelage of a relative of Augustine's, the abolitionist Miss Ophelia who favors equality for blacks through education. In the chapter's most important conversation, Eva asks Topsy why she doesn't self-correct her behavior, to which the latter responds that she would always be black, even if she were good. To this, Eva adds that people could love her, even if she were black. Then Eva, who is blonde, just like Piedad, tells her that Miss Ophelia would love her if she were good. But Topsy stops her: "Miss Ophelia can't stand me because I am black; she can't love me. No one loves blacks...!"

Thus, according to Antonio Guardiola, Martí's story emerges all of a sudden, from one little thing that Eva shouts: "I love you! I love you precisely because no one else does!" Topsy cries for the very first time. She is truly sorry, writes Beecher Stowe. Ophelia, who is one of the few developed characters in the novel, along with Augustine, have witnessed the dialogue without being noticed. Ophelia admits her prejudices, not imagining that Topsy has recognized them. By that time, the blacks at the master's house—a fancy home just like Piedad's—had also rejected Topsy because of the suspicion she inspired in the old, privileged slaves. There is no doubt that no one loved Topsy.

Eva doesn't exactly say in English "I love precisely because no one else does,"but its sense, and everything about it, points right to this idea. In his own way, Martí synthesizes it in almost the same way Antonio Guardiola does much later. After describing her disdain for Leonor, her mother's pressure on her, and the separation she imposes on her, Martí has Piedad tell her doll: "I love you because no one else does!"The concept of "no one" is not really justified, due to the story's brevity, but it certainly is in the novel. 13

For Martí, "The Black Doll" is poverty, mistreatment, wounds, and the rejected skin of a voiceless girl. But Martí will not speak with such crudity to the children who will read what he has written for them. The poet just captures the color, the poverty of the ragdoll, discrimination. He blisters the lack of love a little girl endures (dolls are living creatures for children) whose only sin is to have been born into this world. This interaction is totally different from what Erich Fromm explains in The Art of Loving as the link between mother and child. A child thinks: "they love me because I am." Conversely, the black doll and Topsy are unloved precisely because they exist, because they are."

An obvious remnant of slavery, Piedad's toy becomes a symbolic object of existence, particularly for Cuban readers, who in 1886, only three years earlier, had abolished slavery.

What Martí actually did was take the most humane sense of Beecher Stowe's scene and placed it at the core of a story that was born, as I hope to have demonstrated, through the recreation of various characters and passages from the novel.

Louisiana as the story's scene

Analyses of Marti's story have not yet been able to reveal the place in which its action takes place. There is no defining Latin American element in it that might hint to this, and Cubanness is virtually nowhere to be found. It does suggest that the family it follows is of Hispanic origin. So, as Aurora de Albornoz suggests, "let us try to flesh out a small clue from this ambiguous imprecision," a task cherished by Modernists writers. Yet, the plot may also be connected to *Uncle Tom's Cabin*.

Critic Eduardo Lolo situates the scene at much higher latitudes than those of Latin America, that is, in the United States, and "in a northern zone, specifically (New York, for example).14 Nonetheless, he encounters specifics that don't mesh with his conjecture, which he openly discusses: "[there are] unmistakable 'tropicalizing' elements [such] as the comparison the author makes of the letters's' [that Piedad's father writes] with palm fronds falling, and the mosquito netting (which is totally unknown in the north, because it is not needed) with which Piedad coddled her ragdoll as she slept."15 Still, where does she live? Where does the action take place? I would venture that if New Orleans was a place where Cuban families lived during Martí's time, then

perhaps Louisiana was the place that prevailed in the poet's mind when he wrote his story:

"At the bedpost, where the nightstand is, there is a bronze medallion of a former feast with French ribbons: a large tri-colored bow adorns the medallion's surface, which bears the likeness of a handsome Frenchman who came from France so that men could be free, and another image of the man who invented the lightening rod, with the grandfatherly look he had when he crossed the ocean to ask the European monarchs to help him free his land: that is what appears on this medallion, and Piedad's wonderful game. And on the pillow, sleeping in her arms, is her black doll, whose lips are faded from all the kisses the girl has given her."

There was a party with French ribbons in the colors of the flag of France, and finally an image that could be none other than the Marquis de Lafayette's, the French statesman who gave the best of his life for the independence of the United States. The other image, too, is linked to this country's emancipation; Benjamin Franklin, who in addition was connected to Lafayette, because they knew each other. What is the importance of Lafayette for Louisiana and, of course, New Orleans, a place where U.S., French, and Spanish cultures predominate, and where a large part of the plot of Uncle Tom's Cabin takes place? Historians recall when Lafavette arrived in Louisiana's cultural capital as part of a tour of the Union he started in 1824. A sixty-foot Arch of Triumph was erected in the city's *Place d'Arms*. There was applause, cheering, and even cannon salutes. His welcome was nothing short of tremendous.16

One of Louisiana's most important cities was renamed'Lafayette'four years before Martí penned *La Edad de Oro*. Moreover, in a zone dotted by swamps formed by the waters of the

Mississippi, mosquito netting was an absolute necessity, an essential on beds, windows, and doors. This is an undeniable clue. That Martí compares the letters 's' written by a character with the falling of palm fronds does not mean that he is obligatorily comparing them with those of the Antillean kind. Palm trees did and do abound in Louisiana. I don't think it is a stretch to believe that those palm fronds do not refer to the Antillean species but rather to those Mediterranean Spanish and Canary Island ones that the Spanish colonizers and immigrants transplanted to Louisiana. This palm simile will also be read, undoubtedly, as a reference to Cuba, which Martí must have known.

It does not appear that the poet visited New Orleans prior to 1889, although other prominent Cuban patriots, such as mulatto General Antonio Maceo, and Máximo Gómez, who had been and again would be his commander in war, had. But Martí had already read about myriad American historical and current events that took place in Louisiana, particularly in New Orleans. It would be much later that Martí took up residence in the United States, on September 8, 1876, on the U.S.'s hundredth anniversary, to participate in celebratory events with members of the Cuban society *Obreros de la Independencia* [Workers for Independence].

Among other things, Martí writes about Benito Juárez's stint as a cigarmaker in New Orleans, and about boxing in the U.S., which he rejects for its brutality. In fact, the fight between "the Trojan Giant and Gentleman John Sullivan (of Boston)" would take place amidst "cedars and oak trees," according to Martí, proving he knew of the region's plant life. Thus, a comparison between the letters's' of Piedad's father's writing with the falling of fronds from a U.S. southern palm tree and not a Caribbean or Canary Island one, is no longer surprising.

According to Martí, Cuban exiles in a "cordial and French" New Orleans acclaimed veteran General Carlos Roloff, a Polish man who took on Cuba's independence struggle as his own. The revolutionary separatist club Los Intransigentes [The Intransigents Club], which was affiliated with the Cuban Revolutionary Party, was founded in this city. Martí publicizes Louisiana's cultural capital as host to an exhibition of "prime fruit," and exhorts Latin American producers to attend the six month long event, which would start towards the end of 1886. Earlier, the Cuban weekly La Libertad [Liberty] was published in New Orleans at around the start of the Ten Years War (1868).

My last point is to ask who can assure that the aforementioned feast in a story whose action takes place in spring is not the famous Mardi Gras, which in New Orleans is celebrated at the beginning of spring and involves parades, street dancing, and costumes. One of the many different newspaper dispatches that covered this feast in March 1882 reported that New Orleans was celebrating "its carnival with a sumptuous procession reminiscent of the marvelous grandeur recounted in South Asian poetry."

Not all these allusions come prior to or coincide with 1889, the year in which Martí writes the four magazine issues that comprise the book *La Edad de Oro*, but we cannot discount his knowledge and experience with this particular area of the United States, to which he was close (literally and figuratively) because of the cause for which he worked. Three times he visited Louisiana, New Orleans, to be specific, and he writes a summary description of it during one of those trips.

In proposing Louisiana to situate the story, I am not encountering undeniable "tropicalizing" elements, not even with Martí's simile, in which he says "the house shone like the

first day of spring, after the snow has already gone" for Piedad's birthday. While the use of the 'like' does not force us to take the phrase at face value, since it can signal a sense of equivalency or comparison, a few more facts might be helpful.

Even if snow is not commonly associated with Louisiana, it is not a total stranger to it either. Using information from a website devoted to world weather, I discovered that the minimum temperature in New Orleans has dropped to or below 32 degrees Fahrenheit at least sixty times in the last forty years. Today's global warming could lead us to believe that it may have snowed much more frequently in northern Louisiana, during the nineteenth century. It is not implausible that Piedad's house looked the way Martí described it if we situate the story in this region.

Finally, I dare say that in elaborating the characters in his story "The Black Doll" Martí was thinking of some of Beecher Stowe's. Had he lived in our time, he, too, would consider

Uncle Tom's Cabin a canonical novel. *Don Quixote*, with its sprinkling of anti-Muslim and anti-Jewish prejudice, is indeed canonical, as are others.

If Cuba's nineteenth-century, anti-slave novels passed down non-racist descriptions of black bodies, for example El negro Francisco. by Antonio Zambrana, or Cecilia Valdés, by Cirilo Villaverde, then Beecher Stowe may well have influenced Martí. At this point in his mature life, he was a man whose progressiveness was virtually unequalled by any other Latin American author-white or black. Thus, I believe that in La Edad de Oro. as in José Martí, who quite unlike Tom died fighting for his country's freedom, we can see the presence and influence of not only the Brothers Grimm. Perrault. Andersen. Amicis. Laboulave, Helen Hunt Jackson, and Emerson, among others; but also of U.S., anti-slave author Harriet Beecher Stowe, who certainly impacted other important writers from all corners of the globe.

Notes:

- 1- Martí, José. Obras Completas XXIII (La Habana: MINED, 1963): 125.
- 2- Cepeda, Rafael. *Lo ético-cristiano en la obra de José Martí* (Matanzas: Centro de Información y Estudio "Augusto Cotto," 1992): 82-83.
- 3- Martí, José. Op. Cit. XXIV, 204-205.
- 4- Ibid.
- 5- See Just Butcher, Margaret. *El negro en la cultura norteamericana* [Obra basada en los manuscritos de Alain Locke] (México, Letras S.A., 1958).
- 6- Balfour, Lowrie. "Finding the Words: Baldwin, Race Consciousness and Democratic Theory." In *James Baldwin Now*. [Dwight A. McBride, ed.] (N.Y.: New York University Press, 1999): 75.
- 7- See *The Annotated Uncle Tom's Cabin* [Gates, Jr., H. Louis and Hollis Robins, eds.] N.Y.: W.W. Norton & Co., 2007).
- 8- de Albornoz, Aurora. "José Martí: El Mundo de los Niños Contado con Lenguaje Infantil." In *Acerca de la Edad de Oro* [Selección y prólogo Salvador Arias] (La Habana: CEM-Letras Cubanas, 1989): 358.
- 9- Martí, José. Op. Cit. X, 13.
- 10- Jimi Izrael wrote that sociologists Kenneth and Mamie Clark studied the topic of black identity and self-perception and Columbia University during the 1930s and 1940s. Clark described what is now consid-

- ered to be an infamous analysis of doll, in which black girls were given a choice between black or white dolls, and "the overwhelming majority chose white dolls." See "Skin Games: Color and Skin Tone in the Black Community" Part I, "Blackity-Black," in "Áfricana, Gateway to the Black World," http://www.africana.com/articles/daily/index_20010108.asp (20 de mayo 2003). Obviously, Martí used different points of reference.
- 11- Researcher Salvador Arias told me in a personal conversation that a scene from Louisa May Alcott's novel *Little Women* (1957: 54-55) may have influenced Martí. In it a character cares for and love her dolls.
- 12- Martí, José. Op. cit. IV, 277.
- 13.- Beecher Stowe, Harriet. La cabaña del tío Tom [Translation and prologue by Antonio Guardiola] (Madrid: Aguilar, 1946). What follows are a derivation of ideas that end in Martí and Guardiola's translations. I have highlighted what they translate similiarly into Spanish, which makes sense, since they did not change its meaning and substitute what has already been said. See the "Topsy" chapter in Harriet Beecher Stowe's Uncle Tom's Cabin (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1962). After Topsy tells Eva that she has no father or mother, and that it is not worth it to be good because she is a 'nigger,' and that no one loves blacks, and that she would only change her ways if she could change color, Eva tells her: "O, Topsy, poor child, I love you!" said Eva, with a sudden burst of feeling, and laying her little thin, white hand on Topsy's shoulder; "I love you, because you haven't had any father, or mother, or friends; —because you've been a poor, abused child! I love you."
- 14- Lolo, Eduardo. Mar de Espuma. Martí y la literatura infantil (Miami: Universal, 1995): 197.
- 15- Ibid, 198.
- 16- I owe this and other information to a friend, Manuel García Castellón, a professor at the University of New Orleans.
- 17- Martí, José. Op. Cit. XI, 254.